1	Assessing the impact of chemical pollution on endangered migratory fish within a catchment using a
2	Potentially Affected Fraction of species (PAF) approach: a case study at main rivers and spawning
3	grounds scales

- 5 Benjamin Bellier¹, Sarah Bancel¹, Éric Rochard¹, Jérôme Cachot², Olivier Geffard³, Bertrand Villeneuve¹*
- ¹INRAE, UR EABX, F-33612 Cestas, France; ²Université de Bordeaux, UMR CNRS 5805 EPOC, Allée Geoffroy
 Saint-Hilaire, 33615, Pessac Cedex, Nouvelle-Aquitaine, France; ³INRAE, UR Riverly, F-69100, Villeurbanne,
 France
- **Keywords.** Water contamination, risk assessment, mixtures, Garonne, Dordogne

12 ABSTRACT.

13 Water pollution is a one of the most contributors to aquatic biodiversity decline. Consequently, ecological risk 14 assessment methods have been developed to investigate the effects of existing stresses on the environment, including the toxic effects of chemicals. One of the existing approaches to quantify toxic risks is called 15 16 "Potentially Affected Fraction of species" (PAF), which estimates the potential loss of species within a group of 17 species studied. In this study, the PAF method was applied to the Garonne catchment (southwest France) due 18 to the limited information available on the involvement of water pollution in the decline of diadromous fish 19 populations. This approach was used to quantify the potential toxic risk associated with chemical contamination 20 of water for fish species. The objectives were to quantify this risk (1) in the Garonne and Dordogne rivers and 21 (2) in the spawning grounds of two endangered anadromous fish species: the allis shad and the European 22 sturgeon during the development period of their early life stages. Environmental pollution data was provided for 23 21 sites within the Garonne catchment between 2007 and 2022, and toxicity data was obtained specifically from 24 freshwater toxicity tests on fish species. Then, for each site and each year, the potential toxic risk for a single 25 substance (ssPAF) and for a mixture of substances (msPAF) was calculated and classified as high (>5%), 26 moderate (>1% and <5%) or low (<1%). Potential toxic risks were mostly moderate and mainly associated with: 27 metals > other industrial pollutants and hygiene and care products > agrochemicals. In summary, this study 28 highlights the probable involvement of water contamination on the decline, fate and restoration of diadromous 29 fish populations in the Garonne catchment, focusing notably on the toxic effects on early life stages, a previously 30 understudied topic.

GRAPHICAL ABSTRACT.



34 1. INTRODUCTION

35 Water is generally considered as the most essential natural resource, but the quality of freshwater ecosystems 36 has deteriorated considerably, mainly due to anthropogenic activities (Carpenter et al., 2011; Meybeck, 2003; 37 Vörösmarty et al., 2010). This situation raises growing concerns about the preservation of our water resources 38 and requires urgent measures to limit the degradation of these environments. One of the main factors in the 39 degradation of these ecosystems is water pollution, caused mainly by population growth and industrialization, 40 which is contributing to the decline in freshwater biodiversity (Dudgeon et al., 2006; Pimentel et al., 1997). The toxic effects of chemicals (metals, agrochemicals, etc.) on the fitness of aquatic species are well documented 41 42 (e.g. Kahlon et al., 2018; Schafer et al., 2011) and hypotheses have been discussed concerning the involvement 43 of these substances in the collapse of some aquatic populations (e.g. Limburg & Waldman, 2009; Van Dijk et 44 al., 2013), compromising ecosystems and its associated resources. This is especially the case for diadromous 45 fish populations (*i.e.*, migrating between marine and freshwater systems) for which Limburg & Waldman (2009) 46 described a widespread decrease in numbers in the North Atlantic. According to their assumptions, this dramatic decline could be caused partially by water pollution. Indeed, these species have seen their populations 47 maintained at very low levels of abundance in many parts of the world (Verhelst et al., 2021). 48

49 In France, the Garonne catchment is no exception to this statement (Bover et al., 2000), although it was once 50 previously considered an ichthyological reference (Maury-Brachet et al., 1999). Indeed, the numbers of 51 anadromous fish (i.e., growing in marine environments and reproducing in rivers) such as European sturgeon (Acipenser sturio), allis shad (Alosa alosa), twaite shad (Alosa fallax), Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar), sea 52 lamprey (Petromyzon marinus) and river lamprey (Lampetra fluviatilis); and catadromous fish (i.e., growing in 53 54 rivers and reproducing in marine environments) such as the European eel (Anguilla anguilla) are currently at 55 historically low levels (Almeida et al., 2021; Aprahamian et al., 2003; Castelnaud & De Verdilhac, 1981; ICES, 2014; Martin-Vandembulcke, 1999; Prouzet, 1990; Williot & Castelnaud, 2011). Presently, all of these species 56 57 are classified as more or less endangered (ranging from "near threatened" to "critically endangered") on the IUCN France red list (IUCN, 2019). In this catchment, various factors, including overfishing, migration barriers, 58 59 degradation of spawning grounds, global changes and water contamination, have been investigated as potential 60 cumulative causes (Legrand et al., 2020). However, there are still numerous questions regarding the effects of water contamination (Pannetier et al., 2016), especially on the early life stages of anadromous fish species, 61 62 which are particularly sensitive to environmental factors including chemical pollution (McKim, 1977). For example, in the GGD catchment, Delage (2015) demonstrated a deleterious effect of the contaminated 63 64 sediments on the development of European sturgeon embryos and Blaya et al. (2022) have suggested a 65 potential effect of water contamination on the development of allis shad embryos.

Within the Garonne catchment, the contamination of the water column and sediments by metals, agrochemicals and other industrial substances has been well documented (e.g. Aminot, 2013; Bernard, 2018; Budzinski et al., 1997; Grousset et al., 1999), as well as pollutant accumulation in various fish species (e.g. Acolas et al., 2020; Daverat et al., 2011). Furthermore, the establishment of the Water Framework Directive in France has led to the creation of monitoring networks for water bodies, notably to monitor the presence of chemicals in water. However, although the presence of these substances is well monitored and known, it is rarely associated with toxicity data, and when it is, it focuses only on a single group of substances and/or a small number of substances (Budzinski et al., 1997; Daverat et al., 2011; Grousset et al., 1999). As a result, the toxic risk of this broad
spectrum of pollutants for fish is rarely considered, and even less quantified. It is therefore important to use
methods for quantifying this toxic risk, given the availability of historical contamination data, while considering
the environmental context of endangered migratory fish species.

77 However, few tools are currently available to quantify these toxic effects, which represents a major challenge 78 for research in this field. One of the existing methods in ecotoxicological risk assessment is called "Potentially 79 Affected Fraction of species" (PAF) (Beaumelle et al., 2017; Rämö et al., 2018), which estimates the potential loss of species within a group of species studied. It is based on the concept of "Species Sensitivity Distribution" 80 81 (SSD), which models the differences in a species sensitivity to a pollutant (Posthuma et al., 2002). Thus, by 82 comparing environmental concentrations of one or more pollutants with reference toxicity values, it is possible 83 to predict the percentage of species potentially affected by the presence of this/these substance(s) in the 84 environment (Posthuma & de Zwart, 2006). Although initially developed to estimate toxic risk of pollutant(s) on 85 an ecosystem, PAF approach has also been used to visualize the expected effects on a single taxon, and particularly for the fish species (de Zwart & Posthuma, 2005; Merga et al., 2021; Rämö et al., 2018). However, 86 87 this type of study often focuses on a single group of substances (e.g. Faggiano et al., 2010; Liu et al., 2020; 88 Silva, 2015) and/or a small number of substances (e.g. He et al., 2014; Posthuma & de Zwart, 2012). In the 89 Garonne catchment, the PAF method has been used specifically to assess the agrochemical pressure on 90 various taxa (Faggiano et al., 2010), and particularly on fish species (Shinn et al., 2009). However, none has 91 considered the risk to fish from substances other than agrochemicals. Consequently, in order to determine the 92 existing overall toxic pressure for fish, it is essential to consider the environmental context (past and current 93 contamination pressures, relevant spatio-temporal scales, use of the habitat by the species considered, etc.) 94 and to integrate the widest variety of contaminants present in the environment.

95 This study proposes to use the PAF method specifically to determine the impact of chemical contamination of 96 water (by metals, agrochemicals and other industrial substances) on fish in the Garonne catchment. The PAF 97 method was applied specifically to fish species at two different spatial scales: rivers and spawning grounds 98 within the Garonne catchment, with the aim of studying the global potential impact of chemical contamination 99 for fish species and, more specifically, during the development period of the early life stages of two anadromous species. The objectives of this study were to quantify the potential toxic risk associated with chemical 100 101 contamination of water for fish species (1) in the Garonne and Dordogne rivers and (2) in the spawning grounds 102 of two emblematic endangered anadromous fish species: allis shad and European sturgeon during the 103 development period of the early life stages (embryo and larva). The first objective has been named "main rivers 104 scale" and spatially refers to the catchment's main rivers, *i.e.* sites within the Garonne and Dordogne rivers. In 105 this case, environmental data for the whole year and toxicity data for all fish life stages were used. The second 106 objective has been named "spawning grounds scale" and spatially refers to European sturgeon and allis shad 107 spawning grounds in both catchment's rivers, *i.e.* sites within these spawning grounds. In this other case, 108 environmental data considering the reproduction and development period of the early life stages of European 109 sturgeon and allis shad (i.e., April to August), and toxicity data considering specifically the early life stages of 110 fish were used.

111 2. MATERIALS & METHODS

112

A. Study area & environmental contamination data

113 The Garonne catchment (south-west France, Fig. 1) is characterized by the presence of two main rivers (Garonne and Dordogne), as well as two main urban areas (Toulouse and Bordeaux, with nearly 500,000 114 115 inhabitants and 250,000 inhabitants, respectively, in 2020 according to the INSEE). In 2023, the number of industrial installations classified for environmental protection (ICPE in French, i.e. including activities presenting 116 117 a risk to the environment) in this catchment was 16,443 (Ministère de la Transition Écologique et de la Cohésion des Territoires, 2023). Furthermore, a high level of agricultural activity is observed within this catchment, with 118 119 over 50% of the land used for agriculture: ~50% for cereals including corn, wheat and oilseeds, and 50% for 120 vineyards and fruit trees (Bernard, 2018; Faggiano et al., 2010).

121 Environmental data on chemical contamination were extracted from the "physicochimie.csv" and "phytos.csv" 122 files in the database of the "Système d'Informations sur l'Eau Adour-Garonne" (SIEAG, available at https://adour-garonne.eaufrance.fr/data). The data was obtained for 21 sites (Fig. 1, Table S1) along the two 123 124 main rivers (12 in the Garonne and 9 in the Dordogne). Data covered the years 2007 through 2022. Known 125 European sturgeon spawning grounds (between ~Beautiran and ~Agen in the Garonne, and between ~Libourne 126 and ~Bergerac in the Dordogne) are situated further downstream than those of allis shad (between ~Aiguillon 127 and ~Golfech in the Garonne, and between ~Sainte-Foy la Grande and ~Mauzac in the Dordogne) (MIGADO, 128 2022). Given the proximity of Port St-Pardon to European sturgeon spawning grounds and of Trémolat and St-Nic. de la Grave to allis shad spawning grounds (~10-15km), they have been added to these respective 129 130 spawning grounds.



6

133 Chemical substances were categorized into four classes: metals, agrochemicals, hygiene and care products 134 and other industrial pollutants (Tab. 1). This classification was done using the "family.csv" file in the SIEAG 135 database and the standardized "PubChem" database (available at https://pubchem.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/). Hygiene 136 and care products only began to be monitored in 2016. All chemical data quantified in water and sediment were 137 retained but the matrix of interest for this study was water, since toxicity data for fish are classically obtained in 138 this matrix. Indeed, ~95% of fish toxicity data in the ECOTOX Knowledgebase are associated with the water 139 matrix in 2023 (available at https://cfpub.epa.gov/ecotox/). However, as some substances are particularly 140 hydrophobic, they can easily be accumulated in sediment and secondary resuspended in the water column 141 through hydrodynamical processes (Geffard, 2001). Given these processes, some substances may or may not 142 be quantified in the water depending on sampling time. Therefore, to estimate the concentration of the pollutants 143 that could be resuspended in water from sediments and avoid neglecting some pollutants, soil-water partitioning 144 coefficients were calculated as in the study by Bockting et al. (1993). Thus, quantified measurements obtained 145 from sediments were transformed into quantified measurements obtained in water.

For each substance quantified in water (directly in water and using soil-water partitioning coefficients), the 95th percentile of concentration value was calculated for each site and year studied, aiming to represent a value near the maximum concentration while mitigating the impact of potential outliers (*e.g.*, human error). On the main rivers scale, data collected throughout the year were used, resulting in 284 quantified pollutants. On the spawning grounds scale, only data collected between April and August were used, *i.e.* during the reproduction and early development period for European sturgeon and allis shad (Table S2), resulting in 198 quantified substances.

153

Categories	Details	
Agrochemicals	Herbicides, Fungicides, Insecticides, Other biocides and Metabolites	
Metals	Alkaline earth metals, Transition metals, Post-transition metals, Metalloids, Actinides and Other nonmetals	
Hygiene and Care Products	Pharmaceuticals, Cosmetics and hygiene products, Hormones and Metabolites	
Other Industrials Pollutants	Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons, PolyChlorinated Biphenyls, Per- and PolyFluoroAlkylated Substances, Flame retardants, Plasticizers, Solvents, Degradation products, Others and Metabolites	

Table 1. Classification of the chemical pollutants.

154 155

B. Toxicity data & potential toxic risk estimation

To quantify the potential toxic risk caused by chemicals in the Garonne catchment, a comparison of the environmental concentration of each pollutant with its "Hazardous Concentration for 50% of species" (HC_{50}) value was performed. The HC_{50} for each substance can be calculated as the geometric mean of "median Effect Concentrations" (EC_{50}) specific to each species studied (Payet, 2004). Thus, various EC_{50} and "NO Effect Concentration" (NOEC) from freshwater toxicity tests on fish species ; *i.e.* the most numerous toxicity data for this kind of toxicity tests (Aurisano et al., 2019) ; was extracted from the "ECOTOX Knowledgebase" (available

- at <u>https://cfpub.epa.gov/ecotox/</u>). NOEC were recovered in addition to EC_{50} to recover as much toxicity data as possible. Among the substances quantified in water, 125 substances had toxicity data on the main rivers scale and 78 on the spawning grounds scale. Then, every recovered toxicity data (EC_{50} and NOEC) were transformed into chronic EC_{50} using extrapolation factors calculated in the study of Aurisano et al. (2019), which allowed to represent a long-term exposure for fish (\geq 7 days):
- For acute EC₅₀: EC_{50ch} = EC_{50ac} / 1.71
- 168 For chronic NOEC: EC_{50ch} = NOEC_{ch} * 3.41
- For acute NOEC: EC_{50ch} = NOEC_{ac} * 3.41 / 3.14

170 Where EC_{50ch} represented chronic EC_{50} , EC_{50ac} represented acute EC_{50} , $NOEC_{ch}$ represented chronic NOEC 171 and $NOEC_{ac}$ represented acute NOEC.

- 172 A categorization of the life stages of fish was performed (Table S3) to use toxicity data representing, all life 173 stages for the main rivers scale and only embryos and larvae for the spawning grounds scale, in order to 174 calculate substance-specific HC_{50} (Table S4).
- As described by Pennington et al. (2004), assuming linearity of SSD curve under the HC₅₀, the percentage of fish species potentially affected can be calculated as follows:
 - For single substance: ssPAF = 0.5*(C_S/HC_{50S})*100
- For a mixture of substances (considering an additive model): msPAF = 0.5*∑(C_S/HC_{50S})*100
- 179 Where C_s represented the 95th percentile of the environmental concentration of a substance "S" specific to a 180 year and site, and HC_{50s} represented the HC₅₀ specific to a substance "S".
- The intensity of the potential toxic risk was determined based on the result (in percent) of the ssPAF and msPAF calculations as in the study by Rämö et al. (2018). Consequently, a result below 1% was considered low potential toxic risk, while a result between 1% and 5% was considered moderate potential toxic risk, and a result above 5% was considered high potential toxic risk.
- 185 **3. RESULTS**

177

186 A. Main rivers scale

The potential toxic risk seems to have decreased predominantly throughout the period for most sites (Fig. 2). In the Garonne, among the 13 msPAF values exceeding 10% of potentially affected fish species, 11 were recorded during the period 2007-2012 and 2 after 2012. In the Dordogne, among the 7 msPAF values exceeding 10% of potentially affected fish species, 6 were observed during the period 2007-2012 and 1 after 2012. However, in 2022, solely 2 of the 21 sites studied (1 in both rivers) present a low potential toxic risk (msPAF < 1%).

Sites in the Garonne and Dordogne rivers showed mainly a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < msPAF < 5%) over the entire period. Indeed, 96 of the 188 years studied for the Garonne and 69 of the 141 years studied for the Dordogne presented a moderate potential toxic risk. In addition, a significant proportion of the years studied presented a high potential toxic risk (msPAF > 5%): 54 of the 188 years studied for the Garonne and 36 of the 141 years studied for the Dordogne. Over the period studied, all sites for the Garonne and 2/3 of sites for the Dordogne had at least one msPAF value representing a high potential toxic risk (msPAF > 5%). Furthermore, 38 of the 188 years studied presented a low potential toxic risk (msPAF < 1%) for the Garonne and 36 of the
141 years studied for the Dordogne.

Regarding contributions, metals seem to explain most of the high potential toxic risk values (msPAF max. 48.5% in the Garonne and 44.4% in the Dordogne). However, some contributors generating a high potential toxic risk are also associated with hygiene and care products (msPAF max. 8.41% in the Garonne), and other industrial pollutants (msPAF max. 26.1% in the Garonne and 7.26% in the Dordogne). In contrast, a very small contribution from agrochemicals was highlighted (msPAF max. 3.04% in the Garonne and 2.00% in the Dordogne).



MAIN RIVERS SCALE - GARONNE

Figure 2. Percentage of fish species potentially affected for each site, year and category in the Garonne and
 Dordogne rivers at the main rivers scale (*i.e.*, values were calculated using all sites, all months and toxicity
 data recovered from all life stages). Sites are ordered from downstream to upstream. The dotted red line
 represents the 5% threshold, exceeding which generates a high potential toxic risk. The gray lines represent
 jumps in scale on the y-axis.



MAIN RIVERS SCALE - DORDOGNE

215 All categories of studied pollutants (metals, agrochemicals, hygiene and care products, and other industrial pollutants) generated moderate potential toxic risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%) in the Garonne and Dordogne (Fig. 3). 216 217 In both rivers, three substances had more than 10 ssPAF values representing at least a moderate potential toxic 218 risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%) throughout the study period: copper with 69 values, zinc with 21 values and lead with 219 17 values in the Garonne, and copper with 23 values, metformin with 20 values and zinc with 13 values in the 220 Dordogne. Other substances had less than 10 ssPAF values representing at least a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%): phenol-4-nonyl-branched, diuron, dioctyl-phthalate, benzo[a]pyrene, fluoranthene, 221 222 metformin and estrone in the Garonne; cypermethrin, bisphenol S, lead and bisphenol A in the Dordogne; and 223 oxadiazon, cadmium, ziram, hydroxyterbuthylazine and iron in both rivers.

Only metals and hygiene and care products in the Garonne, and metals and other industrial pollutants in the Dordogne represented a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%). In both rivers, four substances had ssPAF values representing a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%): lead with 2 values, copper with 6 values, estrone with 3 values and zinc with 2 values in the Garonne, and copper with 4 values, bisphenol A with 2 values, lead with 3 values and zinc with 4 values in the Dordogne. None agrochemicals had ssPAF values representing a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%). The highest ssPAF value was obtained by two metals: lead in the Garonne (nearly 25%) and copper in the Dordogne (nearly 40%).



MAIN RIVERS SCALE

Agrochemicals - Hygiene and care products - Other industrial pollutants

231

Metals

Figure 3. Boxplots of substance values exceeding 1% (moderate potential toxic risk) of potentially affected fish species per river at the main rivers scale (*i.e.*, values were calculated using all sites, all months and toxicity data recovered from all life stages). The dotted red line represents the 5% threshold, exceeding which generates a high potential toxic risk. Points (point, square, triangle and cross) indicate values exceeding 5% (high potential toxic risk) of potentially affected fish species.

238 B. Spawning grounds scale

The potential toxic risk seems to have decreased predominantly throughout the period for most sites (Fig. 4). In the Garonne, among the 7 msPAF values exceeding 10% of potentially affected fish species, 6 were recorded during the period 2007-2012 and 1 after 2012. In the Dordogne, among the 5 msPAF values exceeding 10% of potentially affected fish species, all were observed during the period 2007-2012. In 2022, no sites present a low potential toxic risk (msPAF < 1%).

- 244 Sites in the Garonne and Dordogne rivers showed mainly a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < msPAF < 5%)245 over the entire period. Indeed, 42 of the 86 years studied for the Garonne and 36 of the 68 years studied for the 246 Dordogne presented a moderate potential toxic risk. In addition, a significant proportion of the years studied 247 presented a high potential toxic risk (msPAF > 5%): 21 of the 86 years studied for the Garonne and 13 of the 248 68 years studied for the Dordogne. Over the period studied, 100% of sites for both rivers had at least one 249 msPAF value representing a high potential toxic risk (msPAF > 5%). The spawning grounds of both species have msPAF values generating a high potential toxic risk (msPAF > 5%), with the highest value on European 250 251 sturgeon spawning grounds (msPAF max. 100% for European sturgeon and msPAF max. 55% for allis shad). 252 Furthermore, 23 of the 86 years studied presented a low potential toxic risk (msPAF < 1%) for the Garonne and 253 19 of the 68 years studied for the Dordogne.
- Regarding contributions, metals seem to explain most of the high potential toxic risk values (msPAF max. 100% in the spawning grounds of both rivers). In contrast, a smaller contribution from hygiene and care products (msPAF max. 3.81% in the Garonne and 1.48% in the Dordogne), other industrial pollutants (msPAF max. 3.12% in the Garonne and 3.00% in the Dordogne), and agrochemicals (msPAF max. 1.75% in the Garonne and 1.99% in the Dordogne) is visible.

This preprint research paper has not been peer reviewed. Electronic copy available at: https://ssrn.com/abstract=4717813



259

Figure 4. Percentage of fish species potentially affected (at early life stages) for each site, year and category
 in the Garonne and Dordogne rivers at the spawning grounds scale (*i.e.*, values were calculated using sites in
 spawning grounds, April-August months and toxicity data recovered from early life stages). Sites are ordered
 from downstream to upstream. As = *Acipenser sturio* spawning grounds; and Aa = *Alosa alosa* spawning
 grounds. The dotted red line represents the 5% threshold, exceeding which generates a high potential toxic
 risk. The gray lines represent jumps in scale on the y-axis.

266 All categories of selected pollutants (metals, agrochemicals, hygiene and care products, and other industrial pollutants) generated moderate values (1% < ssPAF < 5%) in the Garonne and Dordogne spawning grounds 267 268 (Fig. 5). In the Garonne spawning grounds, three substances had more than 10 ssPAF values representing at 269 least a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%) throughout the study period: copper with 37 values, 270 lead with 21 values and zinc with 11 values, and two in the Dordogne spawning grounds: copper with 23 values 271 and lead with 11 values. Other substances had less than 10 ssPAF values representing at least a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%): branched 4-nonylphenol, dioctyl phthalate, 4-tert-octylphenol, acetochlor 272 273 and estrone in the Garonne spawning grounds; bisphenol A, benzo[a]pyrene and zinc in the Dordogne spawning grounds; and metformin, hydroxyterbuthylazine and iron in both rivers. Of the 232 ssPAF values giving rise to 274 275 a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%), 64 were specific to European sturgeon spawning grounds, 112 were specific to allis shad spawning grounds and 56 were common to the spawning grounds of both 276 277 species.

Only metals in both rivers represented a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%) in the Garonne and Dordogne 278 279 spawning grounds. Four substances had ssPAF value(s) representing a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%) 280 in the Garonne spawning grounds: lead with 5 values, copper with 1 value, zinc with 3 values and iron with 1 281 value, and three substances in the Dordogne spawning grounds: lead with 4 values, copper with 2 values and 282 zinc with 2 values. None agrochemicals, hygiene and care products, and other industrial pollutants had ssPAF 283 values representing a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%). The highest ssPAF value was obtained for lead in 284 the Garonne spawning grounds (100%) and Dordogne spawning grounds (nearly 100%), both in 2009. Of the 36 ssPAF values giving rise to a high potential toxic risk (ssPAF > 5%), 16 were specific to European sturgeon 285 286 spawning grounds, 9 were specific to allis shad spawning grounds and 11 were common to the spawning 287 grounds of both species.



SPAWNING GROUNDS SCALE

288

Metals - Agrochemicals - Hygiene and care products - Other industrial pollutants

Figure 5. Boxplots of substance values exceeding the 1% (moderate potential toxic risk) threshold of
 potentially affected fish species (at early life stages) per river at the spawning grounds scale (*i.e.*, values were
 calculated using sites in the spawning grounds, April-August months and toxicity data recovered from early life
 stages). The dotted red line represents the 5% threshold, exceeding which generates a high potential toxic
 risk. Points (point, square, triangle and cross) indicate values exceeding 5% (high potential toxic risk) of
 potentially affected fish species.

295 4. DISCUSSION

296

A. Study limitations

On the Garonne catchment, this work is the first to use the PAF method specifically estimating toxic risk for fish species with a wide range of pollutants (n = 125 on the main rivers scale and n = 78 on the spawning grounds scale) and over a long-term period (16 years) and to propose a specific adaptation of the method to early life stages. To our knowledge no previous work had adapted the PAF method to the specific life stages of a particular taxon. It has enabled to quantify potential toxic risks in space (sites contained in the main rivers scale and the spawning grounds scale) and time (throughout the period) and to identify substances potentially affecting fish in the Garonne catchment. However, this method is subject to various inherent data limitations.

304 In reality, of all the chemical substances on the European market in 2019 (at least 144,000), i.e. potentially 305 present in the environment, only 0.25% (i.e., 350 substances) were monitored in the water framework directive, 306 assessing water quality in Europe (Posthuma et al., 2020). According to the most recent estimations, this 307 percentage would even be lower given that there are at least 225,000 substances on the European market 308 (ECHA, 2023). Based on these available data only, 39% of European waters are insufficiently protected against 309 individual and combined chemical hazards (Rorije et al., 2022), a high percentage despite the low level of 310 monitoring. Furthermore, among this few number of substances monitored, only 10% are estimated to be 311 quantified in water (Rorije et al., 2022). In this study, using the SIEAG database, only 284 substances of the 312 526 substances in the database (~54%) were quantified at least once over the area and period studied. 313 Furthermore, 96% of the available data was unquantified in water due to low concentrations and/or excessively 314 high quantification thresholds. By the way, no increase in terms of quantification frequency was observed over 315 the period (maximum of quantification in 2010 with ~10%). One of the hypotheses is that no lowering of 316 quantification thresholds occurred during the study period. Thus, the limited environmental data available for 317 some substances has probably affected the quality of the data used to calculate the 95th percentile, particularly 318 for substances of little interest, and therefore little monitored. These findings underline the need to monitor more 319 substances and lower the quantification thresholds in order to process more data and ensure greater robustness 320 of results. In addition, among the substances quantified, ~56% at the main rivers scale and ~61% at the 321 spawning grounds scale had no fish toxicity data available. As in the case of environmental data, the lack of 322 available toxicity data may have resulted in a loss of quality in the toxicity data used. Indeed, when few EC_{50} 323 values were available, the HC₅₀ values calculated were hardly representative of fish taxon, and therefore 324 potentially more representative of a fish species or group of fish species with low or high sensitivity to a pollutant. 325 In addition, toxicity data were obtained on a limited range of species, including toxicity-model species, which 326 may reflect a relatively different sensitivity to substances than the species present in the Garonne catchment. 327 Thus, given the limited environmental and toxicity data available, the potential toxic risk calculated in this study 328 is based on an underestimated number of substances (except for metals whose number is limited, and which 329 have long been the focus of ecotoxicological studies) which may have degraded data quality.

While most of the previous biases appear to have underestimated the potential toxic risk, the use of the 95th percentile (close to the maximum estimate) may have overestimated it. The mean could provide more realistic results. Furthermore, the additive model (*i.e.*, addition of concentrations and responses) simplifies calculations, but is less realistic than a model including the antagonistic and synergistic effects generated by interactions between substances (Altenburger et al., 2003), which can modify, by either decreasing or increasing, the calculated potential toxic risk.

336

B. Origins and effects of potentially impacting substances

337 Although existing biases, the PAF method allowed to identify trends over the period studied, the sites most at 338 risk and the potentially problematic substances or groups of substances. The potential toxic risk to fish appeared 339 to decrease over the period, with higher msPAF values (msPAF > 10%) from 2007 to 2012, in both scales. In 340 2022, only 2 of the 21 sites studied presented a low potential toxic risk (msPAF < 1%) at the main rivers scale 341 and none at the spawning grounds scale. Metals were identified as the main contributors to high msPAF values 342 in both scales and rivers studied. The most problematic substances (high ssPAF values and/or significant 343 number of ssPAF values exceeding at least 1% of fish species potentially affected) were lead, copper, zinc, 344 metformin, estrone (only in the Garonne) and bisphenol A (only in the Dordogne) at the main rivers scale, and 345 lead, copper, zinc and iron (only in the Garonne) at the spawning grounds scale. In addition, 18 and 13 substances (with at least 1 substance per category), had ssPAF values exceeding the 1% threshold (i.e., 346 347 moderate potential toxic risk) at the main rivers scale and the spawning grounds scale, respectively. Of these substances, 11 were common to both scales (iron, zinc, lead, copper, hydroxyterbuthylazine, metformin, 348 349 estrone, benzo[a]pyrene, dioctyl-phthalate, bisphenol A and branched 4-nonylphenol), 7 were found only at the 350 main rivers scale (cadmium, cypermethrin, diuron, oxadiazon, ziram, bisphenol S and fluoranthene) and 2 were 351 found only at the spawning grounds scale (acetochlor and 4-tert-octylphenol). Some pollutants were found 352 specifically in one or other river at concentrations generating at least a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < 353 ssPAF < 5%). On the main rivers scale, 6 substances were specifically impacting in the Garonne (branched 4-354 nonylphenol, diuron, dioctyl phthalate, benzo[a]pyrene, fluoranthene and estrone), 3 in the Dordogne 355 (cypermethrin, bisphenol S and bisphenol A) and 9 in both rivers (cadmium, oxadiazon, ziram, 356 hydroxyterbuthylazine, metformin, iron, zinc, copper and lead). On the spawning grounds scale, 5 substances 357 were specifically impacting in the Garonne (acetochlor, dioctyl phthalate, branched 4-nonylphenol, estrone and 358 4-tert octylphenol), 2 in the Dordogne (benzo[a]pyrene and bisphenol A) and 6 in both rivers (metformin, 359 hydroxyterbuthylazine, iron, zinc, copper, lead). More ssPAF values and a greater variety of pollutants 360 generating at least a moderate potential toxic risk (1% < ssPAF < 5%) and more msPAF values generating a 361 high toxic risk (msPAF > 5%) were observed in the Garonne than in the Dordogne.

362 The three most impacting metals (copper, lead and zinc) were quantified at concentrations generating a high 363 potential toxic risk for fish (ssPAF > 5%) at both scales and in both rivers. These substances are relatively well 364 documented and are well-known to impact fish at all life stages (Authman, 2015) and particularly during in the 365 early life stages by disrupting embryonic development, which can result in fewer hatchlings and deformed 366 larvae, making them less efficient (Jezierska et al., 2009). Historically, metal pollution in the Garonne catchment 367 has been documented and associated with various industrial activities such as mining, tanneries, etc. (Grousset 368 et al., 1999). In this catchment, copper and zinc have been used in agriculture. For example, copper is a 369 compound of the "bouillie bordelaise" particularly used for fungicide treatments in vineyards in France (Baize & 370 Saby, 2006). In addition, ziram (also impacting in this study) is a zinc-based fungicide used and authorized to 371 combat fruit diseases (Cao et al., 2019). In this catchment, vines and fruit trees are particularly exploited by 372 agriculture and could explain their high presence in Garonne and Dordogne rivers (Bernard, 2018; Faggiano et

373 al., 2010; Masson et al., 2006). Regarding cadmium, it had an impact solely in 2009 at Bourret (Garonne) and 374 Brivezac (Dordogne), despite it was a substance particularly problematic in the past (Blanc et al., 2006). Iron 375 toxicity, for its part, is poorly documented. Among hygiene and care products, estrone and metformin have proved particularly impactful, reaching ssPAF values of 8.4% (in 2018 at Lamagistère, Garonne) and 4.3% (in 376 377 2021 at Verdun-sur-Gar., Garonne), respectively. Estrone is a natural estrogen which may result from the 378 transformation of estradiol or ethinyl estradiol (compound found in the most widely used contraceptive pills) 379 (Adeel et al., 2017; Stanczyk et al., 2013). In 2018, downstream of the city of Toulouse, estrone was one of the 380 7 drug residues considered most at risk for the Garonne (Destrieux, 2018). The quantified concentrations of 381 estrone solely in the Garonne are consistent with greater human density (probably associated with the influence 382 of the city of Toulouse). This substance can cause adverse effects in fish, such as reducing the number of fertilized eggs (Imai et al., 2007). As for metformin, is worldwide used oral hypoglycemic agent for the treatment 383 384 of diabetes (Niemuth & Klaper, 2015). It is known to be an endocrine disruptor with estrogenic activities (i.e., 385 mimicking/antagonizing the activity of natural oestrogens) may induce the development of intersex gonads and 386 a reduction in size in males and a decrease in fertility in pairs in fish (Niemuth & Klaper, 2015). Furthermore, 387 among the other industrial pollutants, bisphenol A have proved particularly impactful, reaching values of 25.5% 388 (in 2012 at Cours de Pile, Dordogne) and 6.6% (in 2012 in Pessac, Dordogne). It is mainly used in the production 389 of polycarbonate plastics (~70%), epoxy resins (~20%) and as antioxidant or inhibitor of polymerization (~10%) 390 (Eladak et al., 2015). Bisphenol A can cause significant toxic effects in fish affecting hatching, embryo 391 development and behavior (spontaneous movements and heartbeat rate) and larval development (yolk sac 392 edema, pericardial edema, spinal deformation) (Gao et al., 2022).

393 Acetochlor and 4-tert-octylphenol were specifically toxic to embryos and larvae. Acetochlor is a herbicide 394 banned in 2013 in France and formerly used for weed control in corn (INERIS, 2016), a culture particularly 395 present in this catchment (Bernard, 2018; Faggiano et al., 2010). This substance exceeded 1% of potentially 396 affected fish species at Cadillac (Garonne) in 2007 and Aiguillon (Garonne) in 2007, 2009 and 2012, before its 397 ban. Acetochlor is an endocrine disruptor, particularly affecting thyroid hormones, which can lead to 398 bioenergetic, development and behavioural problems in early life stages of fish (Huang et al., 2021). 4-tert-octyl-399 phenol is a degradation product of non-ionic surfactants (i.e., with a low foaming power) used in the manufacture 400 of resins used to produce plastics, agrochemicals, detergents, hygiene and care products, etc. (Madsen et al., 401 2006). A value for this chemical compound exceeded 1% of potentially affected species at Lamagistère 402 (Garonne) in 2015. It is an endocrine disruptor with estrogenic activity that can affect hatching success and 403 cause developmental problems (blood circulation and swim bladder) at the embryo-larval stages of fish (Gray 404 & Metcalfe, 1999).

405 We observed other contributors above 1% of potentially affected species, but with values near 1% and never 406 exceeding 5% (some agrochemicals and other industrial pollutants). Among agrochemicals, in addition to 407 acetochlor, cypermethrin, diuron, oxadiazon, ziram and hydroxyterbuthylazine were in this case. In this study, 408 the maximum ssPAF value for agrochemicals was 2.6% (associated with hydroxyterbuthylazine in 2013 at 409 Verdun-sur-Gar., Garonne), close to the maximum value of 3.7% associated with carbofuran obtained in the 410 same catchment in the study by Faggiano et al. (2010). These agrochemicals have toxic effects on fish (Cao et 411 al., 2019; Carriquiriborde et al., 2009; Saglio & Trijasse, 1998; Velisek et al., 2014; Zanjani et al., 2018). For 412 example, cypermethrin can reduce survival and cause growth problems (Carriquiriborde et al., 2009), diuron

can disrupt behaviour (Saglio & Trijasse, 1998), oxadiazon can affect hematological and biochemical 413 414 parameters (Zanjani et al., 2018), ziram can disrupt embryonic development and larval behaviour (Cao et al., 415 2019), and therbutylazine can affect development, biochemical parameters and histological parameters in fish. 416 Among other industrial pollutants, in addition to 4-tert-octylphenol, six substances belonging to other industrial 417 pollutants were also in this case: branched 4-nonylphenol, dioctyl phthalate, bisphenol A, bisphenol S, 418 benzo[a]pyrene, fluoranthene. The first three substances are considered as endocrine disruptors in fish 419 (Amaninejad et al., 2018; Adeogun et al., 2018; Moreman et al., 2017) and the last two substances can cause 420 larval abnormalities (edema and spinal curvatures) in fish (Le Bihanic et al., 2014).

Per- and polyfluoroalkylated substances and polychlorinated biphenyls contributed negligibly to ssPAF/msPAF values. The highest ssPAF value were ~0.001% for per- and polyfluoroalkylated substances and ~0.002% for polychlorinated biphenyls. These substances (except short-chain per- and polyfluoroalkylated substances) are particularly hydrophobic and can therefore strongly bind to suspended matter and accumulate in sediment (Ranjbar Jafarabadi et al., 2019; Labadie & Chevreuil, 2011) that could explain their low contributions in this study, despite the use of sediment values that can be resuspended in water.

427

C. Pressure factors and diadromous fish populations

The PAF method has furnished insights on the main potential contributors and, indirectly, on the biological disturbances they may cause to fish. More concretely, this method has been applied to two spatial scales (rivers and spawning grounds), revealing the probability that water contamination can affect all fish species in this catchment, and particularly the early life stages during the development period of anadromous fish species. Moreover, considering the absence of a substantial upstream-downstream gradient in the response to potential toxic risks, migratory species could be impacted across a significant part of their migration.

434 Hypotheses regarding the impact of pollutants in water on aquatic populations have been previously addressed 435 in the scientific literature (Dethlefsen, 1988). For example, Slooff (1982) noted greater morphological anomalies 436 in fish in "more polluted" areas compared to "less polluted" areas. More recent research by Van Dijk et al. (2013) 437 suggested that the insecticide imidacloprid might lead to a reduction in taxonomic richness and abundance of 438 macroinvertebrates in Netherlands surface waters. However, Vijver & Van Den Brink (2014) criticized this work, 439 concluding that imidacloprid was just one stress factor among agrochemicals, themselves being only one stress 440 factor among many others (climate change, invasive species, etc.). Indeed, it is widely acknowledged that 441 pollutant effects can be exacerbated by additional factors such as temperature (e.g. Laetz et al., 2014; Willming 442 et al., 2013). With increasing pressures on ecosystems (climate change, invasive species, acidification, land 443 use change, etc.), research to preserve our freshwater ecosystems appears essential. Therefore, while there is 444 potential toxic pressure in the Garonne catchment, the percentages of potentially affected species quantified 445 should be considered in perspective, as other factors like temperature have not been accounted in the method. 446 Moreover, Smetanová et al. (2014) demonstrated that, although the PAF indicator correlated well with field 447 observations, the use of the 5% threshold often underestimated the observed effects. Thus, the quantifications 448 of this study serve as a relative indicator of toxic pressure, challenging to extrapolate but providing an insight 449 into the actual situation. Consequently, further field studies (ecotoxicological and multi-stress) are indispensable 450 to draw conclusions about the precise implication of water contamination on the current state of diadromous 451 fish.

452 This study serves as a cautionary note by raising questions about the impact of water pollution on the status of 453 migratory fish species, a concern that has been overlooked for too long. Indeed, a deeper understanding of 454 chemical water status in the Garonne catchment and associated toxicity processes could potentially lead to a 455 resurgence in diadromous fish populations if appropriate environmental restoration measures are implemented. 456 For example, in the northeastern United States, resurgent populations of American shad, striped bass, and 457 Atlantic sturgeon have been observed following pollution reductions (Waldman & Quinn, 2022). Le Pichon et al. 458 (2020) have also highlighted alternating declines/resurgences of diadromous fish populations in the Seine 459 estuary, associated with the appearance/disappearance of physical as well as chemical barriers. Thus, the influence of chemical factors on the presence/disappearance of diadromous fish populations appears significant 460 461 and needs to be investigated further. Indeed, 6 of the 9 planetary limits have been exceeded, including that 462 associated with the introduction of new entities (Richardson et al., 2023). This suggests there will be an ever-463 increasing number and diversity of chemical cocktails that will be difficult to identify and control. Given the 464 tendency of chemicals to settle in estuaries, diadromous fish are among the species most vulnerable to this 465 type of stress (Waldman & Quinn, 2022). Consequently, the use of risk assessment methods, such as the PAF 466 method, to quantify the ecological risks faced by specific groups of species appears essential.

467 **5. CONCLUSION**

468 To conclude, this study shows the potentially involvement of water quality in the collapse of diadromous fish 469 species in the Garonne catchment, which has so far remained mainly unexplored. The PAF method has proven 470 to be valuable in identifying spatiotemporal trends in potential toxic risk and pinpointing certain pollutants that 471 could potentially affect the species studied. Additionally, it has demonstrated flexibility in its application, ranging 472 from assessing impacts widely on fish species to specific effects on particular life stages. The identification of 473 the biases inherent in the data showed mainly a limited amount of environmental and toxicity data, which may 474 have an impact on the data quality and, in fine, on the results obtained. According to our results, contamination 475 of the catchment water could indeed be a problem for the recovery and fate of migratory fish populations, 476 particularly through toxic effects of pollutants on early life stages during the development period of anadromous 477 fish species. Consequently, more ecotoxicological field studies using fish models representative of the Garonne 478 catchment and multi-stress studies should be envisaged to better estimated the chemical risk for endangered 479 fish species, and more broadly for declining fish populations.

480

This preprint research paper has not been peer reviewed. Electronic copy available at: https://ssrn.com/abstract=4717813

481 ASSOCIATED CONTENT

482 Supporting information

Table S1. Study sites; Table S2. Life cycle of the European sturgeon (*Acipenser sturio*) and allis shad (*Alosa alosa*); Table S3. Categorization of fish life stages; Table S4. HC₅₀ values obtained for each substance quantified in water at the main rivers scale (Garonne and Dordogne rivers) and the spawning grounds scale (European sturgeon and allis shad spawning grounds).

487

488 AUTHOR INFORMATION

489 Corresponding Author

Bertrand Villeneuve; INRAE Nouvelle-Aquitaine Bordeaux Centre, UR EABX (50 Avenue de Verdun, 33612,
Cestas Cedex, Nouvelle-Aquitaine, France); ORCID: <u>https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7485-9262</u>; Email:
bertrand.villeneuve@inrae.fr

- 493
- 494 Notes
- 495 The authors declare no competing financial interest.
- 496

497 ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We thank the anonymous reviewers for improving this manuscript. This work is part of the "ESPECE EX-SITU"
research project (n° 00006189), financed by the "Agence de l'Eau Adour-Garonne" (AEAG, 90 rue Férétra,
31078, Toulouse Cedex 4, Occitanie, France) and by two research units of the "Institut National de Recherche
pour l'Agriculture, l'Alimentation et l'Environnement" (INRAE): the UR EABX (50 Avenue de Verdun, 33612,
Cestas Cedex, Nouvelle-Aquitaine, France) and the UR RiverLy (5 Rue de la Doua, 69100, Villeurbanne Cedex,
Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes, France).

504

506 ABBREVIATIONS

- 507 SIEAG: "Système d'Informations sur l'Eau Adour-Garonne";
- 508 ICPE: "Installations Classées Protection de l'Environnement";
- 509 C_S: environmental concentration of a substance "S";
- 510 NOEC: NO Effect Concentration;
- 511 NOEC_{ac}: acute NO Effect Concentration;
- 512 NOEC_{ch}: chronic NO Effect Concentration;
- 513 EC₅₀: median Effect Concentration;
- 514 EC_{50ac}: acute median Effect Concentration;
- 515 EC_{50ch}: chronic median Effect Concentration;
- 516 HC₅₀: median Hazardous Concentration;
- 517 HC_{50S}: median Hazardous Concentration specific to a substance "S";
- 518 PAF: Potentially Affected Fraction of species;
- 519 ssPAF: Potentially Affected Fraction of species by a single substance;
- 520 msPAF: Potentially Affected Fraction of species by mixture of substances.
- 521

522 **REFERENCES**

- Acolas, M.-L., Davail, B., Gonzalez, P., Jean, S., Clérandeau, C., Morin, B., Gourves, P.-Y., Daffe, G., Labadie,
 P., Perrault, A., Lauzent, M., Pierre, M., Le Barh, R., Baudrimont, M., Peluhet, L., Le Menach, K.,
 Budzinski, H., Rochard, E., & Cachot, J. (2020). Health indicators and contaminant levels of a critically
 endangered species in the Gironde estuary, the European sturgeon. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, *27*(4), 3726-3745. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-019-05139-5
- Adeel, M., Song, X., Wang, Y., Francis, D., & Yang, Y. (2017). Environmental impact of estrogens on human,
 animal and plant life: A critical review. *Environment International*, 99, 107-119.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2016.12.010
- Adeogun, A. O., Ibor, O. R., Imiuwa, M. E., Omogbemi, E. D., Chukwuka, A. V., Omiwole, R. A., & Arukwe, A.
 (2018). Endocrine disruptor responses in African sharptooth catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) exposed to di(2-ethylhexyl)-phthalate. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part C: Toxicology & Pharmacology*, 213, 7-18. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpc.2018.07.001
- Almeida, P. R., Arakawa, H., Aronsuu, K., Baker, C., Blair, S.-R., Beaulaton, L., Belo, A. F., Kitson, J., 535 536 Kucheryavyy, A., Kynard, B., Lucas, M. C., Moser, M., Potaka, B., Romakkaniemi, A., Staponkus, R., 537 Tamarapa, S., Yanai, S., Yang, G., Zhang, T., & Zhuang, P. (2021). Lamprey fisheries : History, trends 538 and management. Journal of Great Lakes Research, 47, S159-S185. 539 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jglr.2021.06.006
- Altenburger, R., Nendza, M., & Schüürmann, G. (2003). Mixture toxicity and its modeling by quantitative
 structure-activity relationships. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 22(8), 1900-1915.
 https://doi.org/10.1897/01-386
- Amaninejad, P., Hosseinzadeh Sahafi, H., Soltani, M., & Hosseini Shekarabi, S. P. (2018). Endocrine disrupting
 effects of 4-nonylphenol on plasma vitellogenin, reproductive system and histology in koi carp (*Cyprinus carpio*). *International Aquatic Research*, *10*(3), 263-274. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40071-018-0203-8
- Aminot, Y. (2013). Etude de l'impact des effluents urbains sur la qualité des eaux de la Garonne estuarienne : *Application aux composés pharmaceutiques et aux filtres UV* [Doctoral dissertation, Université de
 Bordeaux]. https://theses.hal.science/tel-01124148/

- Aprahamian, M. W., Baglinière, J.-L., Sabatié, M. R., Alexandrino, P., Thiel, R., & Aprahamian, C. D. (2003).
 Biology, Status, and Conservation of the Anadromous Atlantic Twaite Shad *Alosa fallax fallax*. *American Fisheries Society Symposium*, *35*, 103-124.
- Aurisano, N., Albizzati, P. F., Hauschild, M., & Fantke, P. (2019). Extrapolation Factors for characterizing
 Freshwater Ecotoxicity Effects. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, *38*(11), 2568-2582.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.4564
- Authman, M. M. (2015). Use of Fish as Bio-indicator of the Effects of Heavy Metals Pollution. *Journal of Aquaculture Research & Development*, *06*(04). https://doi.org/10.4172/2155-9546.1000328
- Baize, D., & Saby, N. (2006). Le cuivre extrait à l'EDTA dans les sols de France. *Etude et Gestion des Sols*,
 13(4), 259-268.
- Beaumelle, L., Della Vedova, C., Beaugelin-Seiller, K., Garnier-Laplace, J., & Gilbin, R. (2017). Ecological risk
 assessment of mixtures of radiological and chemical stressors : Methodology to implement an msPAF
 approach. *Environmental Pollution*, *231*, 1421-1432. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.09.003
- Bernard, M. (2018). Déploiement large échelle du POCIS pour l'évaluation de la contamination par les
 pesticides dans les eaux de surface : Apports et complémentarité dans le cadre des réseaux de
 surveillance du bassin Adour-Garonne [Doctoral dissertation, Université de Bordeaux].
 https://theses.hal.science/tel-02609345/
- Blanc, G., Schäfer, J., Audry, S., Bossy, C., Lavaux, G., & Lissalde, J. P. (2006). Le cadmium dans le Lot et la
 Garonne : Sources et transport. *Hydroécologie Appliquée*, *15*, 19-41.
 https://doi.org/10.1051/hydro:2006005
- Blaya, M., Geffard, O., Jatteau, P., Pierre, M., & Rochard, E. (2022). Embryonic development in allis shad *Alosa alosa*: A baseline for stress studies. *Journal of Applied Ichthyology*, *38*(4), 468-472.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/jai.14336
- Bockting, G. J. M., van de Plassche, E. J., Struijs, J., & Canton, J. H. (1993). Soil-water partition coefficients for
 organic compounds (679101013; p. 152). National Institute of Public Health and Environment.
 https://rivm.openrepository.com/bitstream/handle/10029/10253/679101013.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowe
 d=y

- Budzinski, H., Jones, I., Bellocq, J., Piérard, C., & Garrigues, P. (1997). Evaluation of sediment contamination
 by polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in the Gironde estuary. *Marine Chemistry*, *58*(1-2), 85-97.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0304-4203(97)00028-5
- 579 Cao, F., Souders, C. L., Li, P., Adamovsky, O., Pang, S., Qiu, L., & Martyniuk, C. J. (2019). Developmental
 580 toxicity of the fungicide ziram in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*). *Chemosphere*, *214*, 303-313.
 581 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.09.105
- Carpenter, S. R., Stanley, E. H., & Vander Zanden, M. J. (2011). State of the World's Freshwater Ecosystems :
 Physical, Chemical, and Biological Changes. *Annual Review of Environment and Resources*, 36(1),
 75-99. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-environ-021810-094524
- Carriquiriborde, P., Díaz, J., López, G. C., Ronco, A. E., & Somoza, G. M. (2009). Effects of cypermethrin
 chronic exposure and water temperature on survival, growth, sex differentiation, and gonadal
 developmental stages of *Odontesthes bonariensis* (Teleostei). *Chemosphere*, *76*(3), 374-380.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2009.03.039
- Castelnaud, G., & De Verdilhac, P. (1981). La pêche dans l'estuaire de la Gironde. *Revue géographique des Pyrénées et du Sud-Ouest*, 52(1), 81-105. https://doi.org/10.3406/rgpso.1981.3641
- Daverat, F., Tapie, N., Quiniou, L., Maury Brachet, R., Riso, R., Eon, M., Laroche, J., & Budzinski, H. (2011).
 Otolith microchemistry interrogation of comparative contamination by Cd, Cu and PCBs of eel and
 flounder, in a large SW France catchment. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science*, *92*(3), 332-338.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2011.01.011
- 595 Delage, N. (2015). Étude expérimentale des effets des contitions environnementales (température, oxygène,
 596 polluants) sur la survie, le développement et le comportement des stades embryo-larvaires d'esturgeon
 597 Européen, Acipenser sturio [Doctoral dissertation, Université de Bordeaux].
 598 https://theses.hal.science/tel-01293673/document
- Destrieux, D. (2018). Résidus de médicaments d'un cours d'eau urbain—Consitution d'une base de données
 pour la gestion des risques écotoxicologiques [Doctoral dissertation, Université de Toulouse].
 https://theses.hal.science/tel-02092971
- Dethlefsen, V. (1988). Status report on aquatic pollution problems in Europe. *Aquatic Toxicology*, *11*(3-4),
 259-286. https://doi.org/10.1016/0166-445X(88)90078-1

- de Zwart, D., & Posthuma, L. (2005). Complex mixture toxicity for single and multiple species : Proposed
 methodologies. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 24(10), 2665-2676.
 https://doi.org/10.1897/04-639R.1
- Dudgeon, D., Arthington, A. H., Gessner, M. O., Kawabata, Z., Knowler, D. J., Lévêque, C., Naiman, R. J.,
 Prieur-Richard, A., Soto, D., Stiassny, M. L. J., & Sullivan, C. A. (2006). Freshwater biodiversity:
 Importance, threats, status and conservation challenges. *Biological Reviews*, *81*(2), 163-182.
 https://doi.org/10.1017/S1464793105006950
- 611 ECHA (European CHemical Agency). (2023). *CL Inventory* [Dataset]. https://echa.europa.eu/fr/information-on-612 chemicals/cl-inventory-database
- Eladak, S., Grisin, T., Moison, D., Guerquin, M.-J., N'Tumba-Byn, T., Pozzi-Gaudin, S., Benachi, A., Livera, G.,
 Rouiller-Fabre, V., & Habert, R. (2015). A new chapter in the bisphenol A story : Bisphenol S and
 bisphenol F are not safe alternatives to this compound. *Fertility and Sterility*, *103*(1), 11-21.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fertnstert.2014.11.005
- Faggiano, L., de Zwart, D., García-Berthou, E., Lek, S., & Gevrey, M. (2010). Patterning ecological risk of
 pesticide contamination at the river basin scale. *Science of The Total Environment*, 408(11), 2319-2326.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2010.02.002
- Gao, Y., Li, A., Zhang, W., Pang, S., Liang, Y., & Song, M. (2022). Assessing the toxicity of bisphenol A and its
 six alternatives on zebrafish embryo/larvae. *Aquatic Toxicology*, 246, 106154.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquatox.2022.106154
- Geffard, O. (2001). Toxicité potentielle des sédiments marins et estuariens contaminés : Évaluation chimique
 et biologique, biodisponibilité des contaminants sédimentaires [Doctoral dissertation, Université de
 Bordeaux]. https://archimer.fr/doc/00000/1482/
- Gray, M. A., & Metcalfe, C. D. (1999). Toxicity of 4-tert-octylphenol to early life stages of Japanese medaka
 (*Oryzias latipes*). *Aquatic Toxicology*, *46*(2), 149-154. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0166-445X(98)00126-X
- Grousset, F. E., Jouanneau, J. M., Castaing, P., Lavaux, G., & Latouche, C. (1999). A 70 year Record of
 Contamination from Industrial Activity Along the Garonne River and its Tributaries (SW France). *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science*, *48*(3), 401-414. https://doi.org/10.1006/ecss.1998.0435

- He, W., Qin, N., Kong, X., Liu, W., Wu, W., He, Q., Yang, C., Jiang, Y., Wang, Q., Yang, B., & Xu, F. (2014).
 Ecological risk assessment and priority setting for typical toxic pollutants in the water from BeijingTianjin-Bohai area using Bayesian matbugs calculator (BMC). *Ecological Indicators*, *45*, 209-218.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2014.04.008
- Huang, T., Wang, S., Souders, C. L., Ivantsova, E., Wengrovitz, A., Ganter, J., Zhao, Y. H., Cheng, H., &
 Martyniuk, C. J. (2021). Exposure to acetochlor impairs swim bladder formation, induces heat shock
 protein expression, and promotes locomotor activity in zebrafish (*Danio rerio*) larvae. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 228, 112978. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2021.112978
- ICES. (2014). Report of the Workshop on Lampreys and Shads (WKLS) (ICES CM 2014/SSGEF:13; p. 206).
 International Council for the Exploration of the Sea. https://iceslibrary.figshare.com/articles/_/18613613
- Imai, S., Koyama, J., & Fujii, K. (2007). Effects of estrone on full life cycle of java medaka (*Oryzias javanicus*),
 a new marine test fish. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 26(4), 726. https://doi.org/10.1897/05539R2.1
- INERIS. (2016). Données technico-économiques sur les substances chimiques en France : Acétochlore (DRC 16-158744-12235A; p. 23). Institut National de l'Environnement Industriel et des Risques.
 http://www.ineris.fr/substances/fr/
- INSEE (Institut National de la Statistique et des Etudes Economiques). (2020). *Population en 2020* [Dataset].
 https://www.insee.fr/fr/statistiques/7704076
- IUCN. (2019). La liste rouge des espèces menacées en France (Poissons d'eau douce de France
 métropolitaine; p. 16). Union Internationale pour la Conservation de la Nature; Muséum National
 d'Histoire Naturelle; Société Française d'Ichtyologie; Agence Française pour la Biodiversité.
 https://uicn.fr/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/liste-rouge-poissons-d-eau-douce-de-france-
- 654 metropolitaine.pdf
- Jezierska, B., Ługowska, K., & Witeska, M. (2009). The effects of heavy metals on embryonic development of
 fish (a review). *Fish Physiology and Biochemistry*, *35*(4), 625-640. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10695-0089284-4

- Kahlon, S. K., Sharma, G., Julka, J. M., Kumar, A., Sharma, S., & Stadler, F. J. (2018). Impact of heavy metals
 and nanoparticles on aquatic biota. *Environmental Chemistry Letters*, *16*(3), 919-946.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10311-018-0737-4
- Labadie, P., & Chevreuil, M. (2011). Partitioning behaviour of perfluorinated alkyl contaminants between water,
 sediment and fish in the Orge River (nearby Paris, France). *Environmental Pollution*, *159*(2), 391-397.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2010.10.039
- Laetz, C. A., Baldwin, D. H., Hebert, V. R., Stark, J. D., & Scholz, N. L. (2014). Elevated temperatures increase
 the toxicity of pesticide mixtures to juvenile coho salmon. *Aquatic Toxicology*, *146*, 38-44.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquatox.2013.10.022
- Le Bihanic, F., Morin, B., Cousin, X., Le Menach, K., Budzinski, H., & Cachot, J. (2014). Developmental toxicity
 of PAH mixtures in fish early life stages. Part I: adverse effects in rainbow trout. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, *21*(24), 13720-13731. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-014-2804-0
- Le Pichon, C., Lestel, L., Courson, E., Merg, M.-L., Tales, E., & Belliard, J. (2020). Historical Changes in the
 Ecological Connectivity of the Seine River for Fish : A Focus on Physical and Chemical Barriers Since
 the Mid-19th Century. *Water*, *12*(5), 1352. https://doi.org/10.3390/w12051352
- 673 Legrand, M., Briand, C., Buisson, L., Artur, G., Azam, D., Baisez, A., Barracou, D., Bourré, N., Carry, L., Caudal,
- 674 A.-L., Charrier, F., Corre, J., Croguennec, E., Der Mikaélian, S., Josset, Q., Le Gurun, L., Schaeffer, F.,
- 675 & Laffaille, P. (2020). Contrasting trends between species and catchments in diadromous fish counts
- 676 over the last 30 years in France. *Knowledge & Management of Aquatic Ecosystems*, 421, 7. 677 https://doi.org/10.1051/kmae/2019046
- Limburg, K. E., & Waldman, J. R. (2009). Dramatic Declines in North Atlantic Diadromous Fishes. *BioScience*,
 59(11), 955-965. https://doi.org/10.1525/bio.2009.59.11.7
- Liu, J., Wu, J., Feng, W., & Li, X. (2020). Ecological Risk Assessment of Heavy Metals in Water Bodies around
 Typical Copper Mines in China. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*,
 17(12), 4315. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17124315
- Madsen, L. L., Korsgaard, B., & Bjerregaard, P. (2006). Oral single pulse exposure of flounder *Platichthys flesus* to 4-tert-octylphenol: Relations between tissue levels and estrogenic effects. *Marine Environmental Research*, *61*(3), 352-362. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marenvres.2005.11.002

Martin-Vandembulcke, D. (1999). *Dynamique de population de la grande alose* (Alosa Alosa. L. 1758) dans le
 bassin versant Gironde-Garonne-Dordogne (France) : Analyse et prévision par modélisation [Doctoral
 dissertation, Institut National Polytechnique de Toulouse]. https://www.theses.fr/1999INPT012A

689 Masson, M., Blanc, G., & Schäfer, J. (2006). Geochemical signals and source contributions to heavy metal (Cd,

- 690 Zn, Pb, Cu) fluxes into the Gironde Estuary via its major tributaries. Science of The Total Environment,
- 691 370(1), 133-146. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2006.06.011
- McKim, J. M. (1977). Evaluation of Tests with Early Life Stages of Fish for Predicting Long-Term Toxicity.
 Journal of the Fisheries Research Board of Canada, 34(8), 1148-1154. https://doi.org/10.1139/f77-172
- Merga, L. B., Mengistie, A. A., Alemu, M. T., & Van den Brink, P. J. (2021). Biological and chemical monitoring
 of the ecological risks of pesticides in Lake Ziway, Ethiopia. *Chemosphere*, *266*, 129214.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.129214
- Meybeck, M. (2003). Global analysis of river systems : From Earth system controls to Anthropocene syndromes.
 Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences, 358(1440),
 1935-1955. https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2003.1379
- MIGADO (Migrateurs Garonne Dordogne Charente Seudre). (2022). Rapport d'activité de l'Association
 Migrateurs Garonne Dordogne Charente Seudre (p. 40). Association Migrateurs Garonne Dordogne.
 file:///C:/Users/bbellier/Downloads/r%C3%A9sum%C3%A9-technique-2022-DEF-L.pdf
- Ministère de la Transition Écologique et de la Cohésion des Territoires. (2023). Installations industrielles
 [Dataset]. https://www.georisques.gouv.fr/donnees/bases-de-donnees/installations-industrielles
- Moreman, J., Lee, O., Trznadel, M., David, A., Kudoh, T., & Tyler, C. R. (2017). Acute Toxicity, Teratogenic,
 and Estrogenic Effects of Bisphenol A and Its Alternative Replacements Bisphenol S, Bisphenol F, and
 Bisphenol AF in Zebrafish Embryo-Larvae. *Environmental Science & Technology*, *51*(21),
 12796-12805. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.7b03283
- Niemuth, N. J., & Klaper, R. D. (2015). Emerging wastewater contaminant metformin causes intersex and
 reduced fecundity in fish. *Chemosphere*, 135, 38-45.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.03.060
- Pannetier, P., Caron, A., Campbell, P. G. C., Pierron, F., Baudrimont, M., & Couture, P. (2016). A comparison
 of metal concentrations in the tissues of yellow American eel (*Anguilla rostrata*) and European eel

- 714
 (Anguilla anguilla).
 Science of The Total Environment, 569-570, 1435-1445.

 715
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.06.232
- Payet, J. (2004). Assessing Toxic Impacts on Aquatic Ecosystems in Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) [Doctoral
 dissertation, Ecole Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne].
 https://aiida.tools4env.com/public/doc/THESE_J.PAYET_2004.pdf
- Pennington, D. W., Payet, J., & Hauschild, M. (2004). Aquatic ecotoxicological indicators in life-cycle
 assessment. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 23(7), 1796. https://doi.org/10.1897/03-157
- Pimentel, D., Houser, J., Preiss, E., White, O., Fang, H., Mesnick, L., Barsky, T., Tariche, S., Schreck, J., &
 Alpert, S. (1997). Water Resources: Agriculture, the Environment, and Society. *BioScience*, *47*(2),
 97-106. https://doi.org/10.2307/1313020
- Posthuma, L., & de Zwart, D. (2006). Predicted effects of toxicant mixtures are confirmed by changes in fish
 species assemblages in Ohio, USA, rivers. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, *25*(4), 1094-1105.
 https://doi.org/10.1897/05-305R.1
- Posthuma, L., & de Zwart, D. (2012). Predicted mixture toxic pressure relates to observed fraction of benthic
 macrofauna species impacted by contaminant mixtures. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*,
 31(9), 2175-2188. https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.1923
- Posthuma, L., Suter, G. W., & Traas, T. P. (2002). Species sensitivity distributions in ecotoxicology. Lewis
 Publishers.
- Posthuma, L., Zijp, M. C., de Zwart, D., Van de Meent, D., Globevnik, L., Koprivsek, M., Focks, A., Van Gils, J.,
 & Birk, S. (2020). Chemical pollution imposes limitations to the ecological status of European surface
 waters. *Scientific Reports*, *10*(1), 14825. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-71537-2
- Prouzet, P. (1990). Stock characteristics of Atlantic salmon (*Salmo salar*) in France : A review. *Aquatic Living Resources*, 3(2), 85-97. https://doi.org/10.1051/alr:1990008
- Rämö, R. A., van den Brink, P. J., Ruepert, C., Castillo, L. E., & Gunnarsson, J. S. (2018). Environmental risk
 assessment of pesticides in the River Madre de Dios, Costa Rica using PERPEST, SSD, and msPAF
 models. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 25(14), 13254-13269.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-016-7375-9

- Ranjbar Jafarabadi, A., Riyahi Bakhtiari, A., Mitra, S., Maisano, M., Cappello, T., & Jadot, C. (2019). First
 polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) monitoring in seawater, surface sediments and marine fish
 communities of the Persian Gulf: Distribution, levels, congener profile and health risk assessment.
 Environmental Pollution, 253, 78-88. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2019.07.023
- Richardson, K., Steffen, W., Lucht, W., Bendtsen, J., Cornell, S. E., Donges, J. F., Drüke, M., Fetzer, I., Bala,
 G., von Bloh, W., Feulner, G., Fiedler, S., Gerten, D., Gleeson, T., Hofmann, M., Huiskamp, W.,
 Kummu, M., Mohan, C., Nogués-Bravo, D., ... Rockström, J. (2023). Earth beyond six of nine planetary
 boundaries. *Science Advances*, *9*(37), eadh2458. https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.adh2458
- Rorije, E., Wassenaar, P. N. H., Slootweg, J., van Leeuwen, L., van Broekhuizen, F. A., & Posthuma, L. (2022).
 Characterization of ecotoxicological risks from unintentional mixture exposures calculated from
 European freshwater monitoring data : Forwarding prospective chemical risk management. *Science of The Total Environment*, *822*, 153385. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.153385
- Saglio, P., & Trijasse, S. (1998). Behavioral Responses to Atrazine and Diuron in Goldfish. Archives of
 Environmental Contamination and Toxicology, 35(3), 484-491. https://doi.org/10.1007/s002449900406
- Schäfer, R., B., van den Brink, P., J., & Liess, M. (2011). Impacts of Pesticides on Freshwater Ecosystems. In
 F. Sánchez-Bayo, P. van den Brink J., & R. Mann M. (Éds.), *Ecological Impacts of Toxic Chemicals* (p.
 111-137). Bentham Science Publishers.
- Shinn, C., Dauba, F., Grenouillet, G., Guenard, G., & Lek, S. (2009). Temporal variation of heavy metal
 contamination in fish of the river lot in southern France. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety*, 72(7),
 1957-1965. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2009.06.007
- Silva, E. (2015). Approaches to improve the ecological risk assessment of pesticides in freshwaters [Doctoral
 dissertation]. Universidade de Lisboa.
- Slooff, W. (1982). Skeletal anomalies in fish from polluted surface waters. *Aquatic Toxicology*, 2(3), 157-173.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/0166-445X(82)90013-3
- Smetanová, S., Bláha, L., Liess, M., Schäfer, R. B., & Beketov, M. A. (2014). Do predictions from Species
 Sensitivity Distributions match with field data? *Environmental Pollution*, *189*, 126-133.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2014.03.002

- Stanczyk, F. Z., Archer, D. F., & Bhavnani, B. R. (2013). Ethinyl estradiol and 17β-estradiol in combined oral
 contraceptives : Pharmacokinetics, pharmacodynamics and risk assessment. *Contraception*, 87(6),
 770 706-727. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.contraception.2012.12.011
- Van Dijk, T. C., Van Staalduinen, M. A., & Van der Sluijs, J. P. (2013). Macro-Invertebrate Decline in Surface
 Water Polluted with Imidacloprid. *PLoS ONE*, 8(5), e62374.
 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0062374
- Velisek, J., Stara, A., Koutnik, D., & Machova, J. (2014). Effect of Terbuthylazine-2-hydroxy at Environmental
 Concentrations on Early Life Stages of Common Carp (*Cyprinus carpio* L.). *BioMed Research International*, 2014, 1-7. https://doi.org/10.1155/2014/621304
- Verhelst, P., Reubens, J., Buysse, D., Goethals, P., Van Wichelen, J., & Moens, T. (2021). Toward a roadmap
 for diadromous fish conservation: The Big Five considerations. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment*, 19(7), 396-403. https://doi.org/10.1002/fee.2361
- 780 Vijver, M. G., & van den Brink, P. J. (2014). Macro-Invertebrate Decline in Surface Water Polluted with 781 New Analyses. Imidacloprid : Rebuttal and Some PLoS ONE, 9(2), e89837. А 782 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0089837
- Vörösmarty, C. J., McIntyre, P. B., Gessner, M. O., Dudgeon, D., Prusevich, A., Green, P., Glidden, S., Bunn,
 S. E., Sullivan, C. A., Liermann, C. R., & Davies, P. M. (2010). Global threats to human water security
- 785 and river biodiversity. *Nature*, 467(7315), 555-561. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature09440
- Waldman, J. R., & Quinn, T. P. (2022). North American diadromous fishes : Drivers of decline and potential for
 recovery in the Anthropocene. *Science Advances*, 8(4), eabl5486.
 https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.abl5486
- Williot, P., & Castelnaud, G. (2011). Historic Overview of the European Sturgeon Acipenser sturio in France :
 Surveys, Regulations, Reasons for the Decline, Conservation, and Analysis. In P. Williot, E. Rochard,
 N. Desse-Berset, F. Kirschbaum, & J. Gessner (Éds.), *Biology and Conservation of the European* Sturgeon Acipenser sturio L. 1758 (p. 285-307). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Willming, M. M., Qin, G., & Maul, J. D. (2013). Effects of environmentally realistic daily temperature variation on
 pesticide toxicity to aquatic invertebrates. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 32(12), 2738-2745.
 https://doi.org/10.1002/etc.2354

- Zanjani, S. A., Emadi, H., Jamili, S., & Mashinchian, A. (2018). DNA damage and hematological changes in
 Common carp (*Cyprinus carpio*) exposed to oxadiazon. *International Journal of Aquatic Biology*, *5*(6),
- 798 387-392. https://doi.org/10.22034/ijab.v5i6.417